

Séminaire general du centre d'études européennes.

Jeudi 3 juin 2010. 12h30-14h00

Competition for the Best and the Brightest

Lucie Cerna (Oxford university)

Virginie Guiraudon (CNRS, CERAPS)

The case of France :

INTRODUCTION:

First of all, who are the best and brightest ?

There is nooo universal definition. Mostly education and particular professions, some focus on salary.

Several definitions for high skilled immigration: Generally international expulsed sectors (or some public sectors, medicine, education).

This paper feeds into L.C's previous work on 4 different countries

Capital and trade follow relatively freely, but labour mobility remains restricted. Accepted the economics of globalization, not the political dimensions (ipods vs people)

Labour shortages and ageing populations

High-skilled immigration is key for these economies. The study of political processes and policy-making associated with HSI is important.

Research questions:

1) To what degree has France become a country of high-skilled immigration?

2) What does the French case reveal about the contemporary politics of high-skilled immigration to Western Europe?

Research on the evolution of HSI policies and analyses how coalitions form and changes

France has changed its way at looking at immigrants.

HSI index – restrictive to less restrictive. Constant policy changes in the countries for third country nationals. Not as many changes as towards EU nationals

(France not many changes – economic crises)

Literature, looked at convergence of policies (apart from sociological and economic convergence). Varieties of capitalism authors focus on economic arguments.

Political economy approach. Combines litt. On comparative political economy

Political economy framework: Preferences, institutions (Labour market org, and pol. Representation), outputs

6 different scenarios: When HS labour involved, most restrictive. Most open when capital involved.

France – 50/60 labour migration, mainly low-skilled. Recruitment stop in 1974

Followed by family and reunification

Current goal: rééquilibrage: family-labour migration. Before: 90%, now:75%, goal:50%

French focus on HSI: Compete globally, migrants contribute to growth, limit family reunification, diversify migration flows, learning from other countries (Uk, Aus. Canada). Discussions about point system, abandoned

Policy making: State remains strong, Limited influence of non-state actors (compared to other countries). Informal integration with union and employers (low integration into policy-making), Professional associations

Actors: President, min of imm, OFII, labour market actors; employers/union/proff. Ass

None of the Cadres unions, - except it-union (98)- , have put pressure for changes. Some reports from the Chamber of commerce and think tanks underline the need for HSI. Not as proactive as in other countries (US), most changes come from the French state – and it is to note that this often has to do with demand

Main circulars and laws affecting HIS:

2004 – 1998 decree revised (followed case of Uk, 2002)

2006 – HSI, focus on all types of imm. New category for labour migrants

Current permits: carte competences et talents, carte salarié en mission, carte contribution économique exceptionnelle (investissement en France), carte scientifique, liste des métiers en tension (150 – both low and high, new Eu member states) (30, mainly HS – third country) inspiration from other countries

Carte competences et talents: 3 year, renewable, interested in countries of origin, development – not renewable from priority solidarity zone. 11 in 2007, 473 in 2008, 593 in 2009. Seems attract science, management. Adm. Criteria established by talent commission

France is looking for other ways of attracting imm. Looking to EU: blue card. Blue card provisions inspired by French Presidency pact. Supposed to compete with US green card. Still up to countries to decide how many to admit. Min imm wants to introduce Blue card, bring more advertisement, parliament will transpose directive by june 2011 (spouses automatically accepted)

Comparisons : Different coalitions between actors. Different level of pressure on govern

GERMANY:

Labor market actors involved in policy-making, influence limited for HS labour organizations. Coalitions between low-skilled unions and employers associations.

Main changes: 2000 green card, 2004 imm. law, 2009 Arbeitsmigrationsteuergesetz

Reluctant about blue card

UK:

Labour market actors engage in consultations, Unions limited influence. Employers much more interested in liberalization

Main changes: 2008: points-based system,

Uk has been moving towards restriction, abuse of system and eco. Crises

Uk, Ireland, Denmark opt-out blue card

CONCLUSIONS:

French state, increasing influence from non-state and EU

Differences in case study to varying coalitions and institutions

DISCUSSION: Virginie Guiraudon

France, choice of research topic. What does HS immigration mean? For economics, pol. economists.

Related policy areas are: (higher) education – global competition between uni's and higher education systems in the world. Student immigration also linked to brain drain

Multilevel governance, EU.. GATS (intra-company transfers, France low in the figures compared to UK – move within int. company).

Intellectual problem : Mig. Studies vs. pol economy. Variety of capitalism litt, welfare litt, these fields don't talk to one another on this issue.

Figures – start investigating what is driving differences – number of alternative reasons

A new generation of scholars asking whether we actually need labour migration in France, and which migrants?

Patrick Weil would say: indeed problems in France at adm level (not so much legal), focus on after when the law is passed. Always the possibility to labour migration, a decision taking by administrative Authorities, decisions taken behind closed doors. Sarkozy – changes, symbolic politics or not??. The proof is in the implementation.

Presidential elections: Sarkozy had to say imm. 'Choisie', however less used in speeches now – back to 'subie'

Statistical manipulation (using EU citizens as incoming migrants)

How come France does not care about talent?

80% of skilled workers from Maghreb – go to US, Canada and so forth. No attempt to attract more than the remaining 20% in France.

Role of interest groups: 95 article. Client policies depending on cost-benefits, US Construction/care sector modernized to have migrants coming, which happened through direct negotiations with executives – how come France has yet to develop organized politics?

IN UK case, No immigrant associations that are actually Supporting migration –

In US: Irish, lobbying for Irish but also other immigration policies

Questioning research methods : Press articles, rtl – not usually French scholars standard. Interviews, reliability. When so many countries included in the research, why sporadic interviews instead of OECD stats

At the end: metropolis conferences (in English) – Canadians involved in beginning, most in English. Many NGO's, researchers, few ministers etc – is this 'administration de la prevue' that France doesn't care about labour migration?

LUCIE CERNA:

METHOD: interviews, ministries, unions, professional Associations, some imm. Experts – anonymous often the most interesting. Newspapers due to lack of litt.

Metropolis anecdote – different way of looking at HSI than Canada, Australia that are looking to US, pushing hard

Problem of the research: Has no dependent variable, no longer timeperiod to test – most policy outcomes than openness in adm.

Why doesn't France more clan politics, interest groups preferences in specific policy areas: Only when need for high-skilled workers is felt, easier when already part of policy-making (coalitions were built) , FR employers look for French labour, not that much labour shortage.

France is not a case of lobbying for HSI – doesn't fit into any other cases, hard to point down, hard to grasp policy changes – symbolic politics. Many migrants could have come under the former permit, but when a specific permit you show symbolic gesture and image to the world. The low numbers testify this. The head of talent commission thinks that they should get rid of commission. Recent years much more focus on regular migration. It depends on imm. Minister and his priorities. The French case is puzzling.

Virginie Guiraudon

There is no puzzle, France doesn't need IT specialists. There are other HS, foreign doctors – cheaper, low status, seasonal, highly skilled lower payed in France. We want skilled but cheap, not so generous . Other low-skilled (strawberry pickers) were specific labour needed

LUCIE:

Often worse status, less protected – interested because offer worse conditions (native HS workers against foreign HSworkers) . Employers happy, people get treated, unions against, native HS workers against

1^{er} SERIE DE QUESTIONS/REPONSES:

Acteurs non-etatiques, entre family-labour migration, categories ? Lucie n'a pas regardé d'autres acteurs non-etatiques. Problemes de categories, imm. Familiale/travail - d'autres pays (UK) differences entre professionnel et famille, souvent c'est caché que les gens travaillent en France

Carte compétence, talent – plupart va vers Chine, Japon, etc. Pour la zone solidaire ils ne peuvent que rester 6 ans donc veulent autre catégories .

Integration dans tout ça, le racisme ? Ecart entre décret, circulaire – et pratique à cause du racisme, integration etc. Allemagne a le même problème. (1 raison langue, 2 mauvaise image pour immigrants).

6 diff types de coalition – influence pour pouvoir,

France « n'a pas besoin de talents » – problème de monopole aux grandes écoles, grandes firmes ? Lien proche entre : Grande école, Grands employeurs, grandes firmes. Employeurs Fr cherchaient pas à l'étranger. Système spéciale

QUESTION :

Medecins etrangers ne sont pas concurrents aux nationaux medecins (ouverture sur marché quand les different cadres respectés) Secteurs bcp d'importance. Concentré sur secteurs ouverts : comme secteurs publiques (bcp de conditions) . HSI – secteurs ouvert a la competition. IT ingenieurs, sciences dures, PHD's – pas bcp de chiffres

Grands ecoles, modele pol. Economique, (le capitalisme de l'heritier) – modele de reproduction social inedit, une élite, systeme de caste – n'admet pas des outsiders, immigration des talents/choisi met en danger ces castes. Pour medecins ils ont trouvé accord pour difference de status, travailler le weekend. Contrairement aux US – patronat premier entrepreneur vers HSI

Cas francais, prouve pas exemple /hypothese des syndicats pour lutter pour HSI. Allemagne : intéressé par étudiants, autre modele qui a marché – employers, syndicats ensemble pour pousser gouvernement

Il y a des exemples ou syndicat de cadres poussent gouvernement pour immi.

Quel type de pol. Economie, autres pol. Economies – simplification des deux cas sans assez de pol ni eco. Cas eco : France refuse investissement etranger, 94 ouvre – apres on est parmi les 2 premiers pays. Les grands entreprises – qui negocient avec ministere, bcp d'investissement devienne t PME (pas necessairement au centre, nord-pas de calais etc). Parce que economie d'ouvre, ces problemes se creent. Pas besoin de passer par ass. Employers (grands banques, entreprises) rdv informel avec ministre – acteurs individuels

Chiffres : regarder autres politiques a coté, pol d'aide au retour – plusieurs pol. Avec intense policy implications – coalitions faut sortir de pol- economy.

Methode : statistiques sur immi. Pas fiable, application sur modeles pas simple

Virginie Guiraudon

% high skilled/low, mais secteurs

Montrer - preuves : comment mesurer influence :

2 hypotheses – grandes ecoles, de grandes entreprises- plus petit

Années 30 – medecins du pays de l'est – secteurs emplois fermés (pharmaciens). Medecins 2000, seule vagues de imm. Qualifié les années 30. Medecine liberale – canada (garde - 900 dollars). Crise sur imm. Precedentes - % labour shortages, marché secondaire. Pas besoin de ca en france. – Toujours 'labor shortages' parce que immi. Sont payé moins cher que US citizens

Professions meme : pas contradiction contre discours liberale, si l'etat garde droit sur professions – garde d'enfant (droit autravail, mais prix cher pour diplome) Programme d'ingenieurs : allemagne – (grandes ecoles), preference nationale